Historic District Planning

Why establish a Historic District?
- Protection of historic properties
- Public relations and promotion
- Economic incentives
- Control of new development
- Preservation is a recognized strategy for sustainable growth

Protection
Protection from adverse effect caused by Federally funded projects
- Section 106 Review
Local enabling ordinances

Economics
Increased Property Values
"Using a variety of methodologies, conducted by a number of independent researchers…in New Jersey, Texas, Indiana, Georgia, Colorado, Maryland, North and South Carolina, Kentucky, Virginia, and elsewhere…results of these studies are remarkably consistent: property values in local historic districts appreciate significantly faster than the market as a whole…"
CRM "The (Economic) Value of National Register Listing
14-23% (Memphis, Tennessee, 2006)
5-20% (Texas, 2006)
**Economics**

**Impact of Various Economic Activities**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Per $1 Million in Expenditures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Highway Construction</td>
<td>Jobs: 33.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Construction Buildings</td>
<td>36.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rehabilitation of Historic Buildings</td>
<td>38.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household Income</td>
<td>$1,197,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$1,223,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$1,302,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State Taxes</td>
<td>$101,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$103,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$110,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Taxes</td>
<td>$85,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$86,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$92,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


**Economics**

Even under current conditions and forecasts, there are funding incentives:

- Community Development Block Grants (CDBG)
- Energy and Environmental Block Grants (EEBG)
- Historic Preservation Tax credits
- Historic Preservation Incentives
- Low Income Housing Tax Credits
- New Market Tax Credits
- Redevelopment opportunities

Santa Land, Colorado Springs, CO

**Design Controls**

**Win-Win solutions**

- McDonalds, Freeport, ME
- Rite Aid, Camden, ME

**Sustainability**

Historic buildings possess inherent green qualities:

- Embodied energy
- Energy Utilization Index (EUI)
- Impacts of demolition/replacement
- Low technology/climate-based design
- Original walkable communities

Mesa Verde NP

**Embodied Energy**

“The sum total of all the energy used to acquire raw materials, transform them into building materials, transport them to the building site, and construct the building.”

**Energy Utilization Index (EUI)**

Many historic buildings are already energy efficient

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Average energy consumption Btu/sq. ft</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Before 1920</td>
<td>89,127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1920 – 1945</td>
<td>90,234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1946 – 1959</td>
<td>90,198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960 – 1969</td>
<td>90,976</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970 – 1979</td>
<td>94,968</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990 – 1999</td>
<td>88,834</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000 – 2003</td>
<td>79,703</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Commercial Building Energy Consumption Survey, 2003
U.S. Department of Energy
Impact of Demolition/Replacement

• Actual recovery time of embodied energy costs
• Demolition cost/energy
• Materials flows

Economic Analysis: Simple Payback

G. H. Schettler House

Case 1: Rehabilitate Original House
New Materials Needed: 24.5 tons
Construction Waste: 22.8 tons
Total Material Stream: 47.3 tons
84.9% recycled content from original construction.

Case 2: Build New House in the Suburbs
New Materials Needed: 173.5 tons
Construction Waste: 88.4 tons
Total Material Stream: 261.9 tons ~4X Case 1
0% recycled content (no original construction to reuse).

Case 3: Demolish House and Rebuild Comparable New House (but not a "McMansion")
New Materials Needed: 173.5 tons
Construction Waste: 88.4 tons
Total Material Stream: 351.8 tons ~7.4X Case 1
0% or only nominal recycled content from original construction.

Low Technology
Climate-Based Design

• Thermal mass
• Passive thermal control
• Daylighting
• Convective Cooling

Walkable Communities

Main Street and beyond

Fl. Douglas, SLC, UT

Historic District Planning

Enabling Legislation

The granting authority from the state given to cities and municipalities to enact a local preservation ordinance that includes the power to:

– Regulate private actions through permit process
– Designate historic properties and districts to prevent incompatible alterations, demolition, or new construction
– Establish specific processes for economic hardship, special merit exceptions, and appeals
Historic District Planning

Local Preservation Ordinance

The key components to a local ordinance include:

1. Statement of “Purpose” or “Powers and Authorities”
2. Definitions
3. Establishment and authority of historic preservation commission or board
4. Criteria and procedures for designation of historic landmarks and/or districts
5. Statement of reviewable actions and their effect

6. Criteria and procedure for review of such actions
7. Standards and procedures for the review of “economic hardship” claims
8. “Affirmative maintenance” requirements and procedures governing “demolition by neglect”
9. Procedures for appeal from final preservation commission decision
10. Fines and penalties for violation of ordinance provisions

Historic Property Listing

The registers on which local historic properties can be listed include:

- National Register of Historic Places
  - National significance
  - Statewide significance
  - Local significance
- State Register
  - Statewide or local significance
- Local Register
  - City, town, county
  - “Salt Lake City Register of Cultural Resources”

National Register of Historic Places

How to apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation

http://www.nps.gov/nr/

National Register of Historic Places (NRHP)

Is composed of:
- Districts
- Sites
- Buildings
- Structures
- Objects

that are significant in American history, architecture, archeology, engineering, and culture.

District

“a significant concentration, linkage, or continuity of sites, buildings, structures, or objects united historically or aesthetically by plan or physical development.”
Historic District Planning

Site
“the location of a significant event, a prehistoric or historic occupation or activity, or a building or structure, whether standing, ruined, or vanished, where the location itself possesses historic, cultural, or archeological value regardless of the value of the value of any existing structure.”

Topaz Internment Camp
Delta, UT

Historic District Planning

Building
“...created principally to shelter any form of human activity.”

Albert Fisher Mansion,
Salt Lake City, UT

Historic District Planning

Structure
“those functional constructions made usually for purposes other than creating human shelter.”

Bullock-Beck Head Frame,
Eureka, UT

Historic District Planning

Object
“those constructions that are primarily artistic in nature or are relatively small in scale and simply constructed. Although it may be, by its nature or design, movable, an object is associated with a specific setting or environment.”

Zions First National Bank Clock,
Salt Lake City, UT

Historic District Planning

Historic Criteria
Criterion A: events that have made significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.

Golden Spike NHS
Promontory Point, UT

Criterion B: association with the lives of persons significant in our past

Wilford Woodruff House,
Salt Lake City, UT

Historic District Planning

Historic Criteria
Criterion C: embodies distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represents the work of a master, or that possesses high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

Caithness Apartments,
Salt Lake City, UT

Historic District Planning

Historic Criteria
Criterion D: may or already have yielded information important to prehistory or history.

Mesa Verde NP
National Register of Historic Places
http://www.nps.gov/nr/

Researching a Historic Property
Defining Boundaries for National Register Properties
Guidelines for Local Surveys: A Basis for Preservation Planning

Historic District Planning
Establishing a Historic District:
Defining Boundaries

Information gathering:
- SHPO reconnaissance surveys
- SHPO intensive level surveys
- Local municipal planning department
- Archival research
- Windshield survey
- Pedestrian survey

Establishing A Historic District
Take Stock
Photographic survey
Physical inventories
Identify features

Analyze Inventory
Significant Resources
Contributing Resources
Non-Contributing Resources

Define the district

Historic District Planning
Evaluating a District in its Historic Context

Determine these five things:
1. What facet of prehistory or history of the local area, state or the nation is represented?
2. Is that facet significant?
3. Does the district illustrate the historic context?
4. How does the district illustrate that context?
5. Do the physical features of the district convey that facet of prehistory or history?

Defining Historic District Boundaries
Consider:
1. Distribution of resources
2. Current legal boundaries
3. Historic boundaries
4. Natural features
5. Cultural features
6. Integrity
7. Setting
8. Use
9. Research potential

Historic District Planning
National Register of Historic Places
http://www.nps.gov/nr/
**National Register of Historic Places**

National Register Registration Form

**Historic District Planning**

1. Historic Name of Property
2. Location
3. State/Federal Agency Certification
4. National Park Service Certification
5. Classification
6. Function or Use
7. Description
8. Statement of Significance
9. Major Bibliographical References
10. Geographic Data
11. Form Prepared By

**Design Guidelines**

- Flexible, otherwise, they promote excessive conformity
- A result of public participation or the public will not accept them
- Identification of the most characteristic design elements
- Minimum standards of compatibility

**Secretary of the Interior Standards**

“Guidelines for…”

The basis for many local design guidelines

http://www.nps.gov/history/hps/tps/standguide/

**Design Guidelines Are:**

- Flexible, otherwise, they promote excessive conformity
- A result of public participation or the public will not accept them
- Identification of the most characteristic design elements
- Minimum standards of compatibility

**Design Guidelines Can:**

- Improve the quality of physical changes
- Protect the value of investments
- Protect existing architectural character
- Act as a base for objective decision-making
- Increase public awareness of architectural quality
- Prevent incompatible new construction
**Design Guidelines**

Do not or Can Not:

- Regulate growth
- Control non-exterior changes
- Guarantee *good* design
- Be law

**Common Major Goals**

- Sufficient architectural and archival research
- Historic details identified and retained

**Historic Fabric Retention**

- Sensitive additions

**Authenticity versus false history**

- Sensitive changes for ADA
Creating A Design Guideline

Choose approach
- Identify status of revitalization effort
- Identify how guidelines will be used

Organize
- Identify and recruit members of core group
- Have city government adopt official advisory committee
- Elect a chairperson
- Identify and appoint staff
- Determine goals, objectives, budget, and timeline

Involve Consultants

Creating A Design Guideline

Hold Public Workshops
- Determine time and place for meeting(s)
- Send out notices
- Build consensus
- Issue press releases
- Select facilitator
- Work in small groups (6-10 people)
- Send follow-up mailings

Salt Lake City Preservation Plan Workshop
Creating A Design Guideline

Write Guidelines

• Introduction
• Criteria
  - Height
  - Width
  - Setback
  - Proportion of openings
  - Horizontal rhythms
• Alterations
• Demolition

Guideline Criteria

“…As seen from a public way…”

• Height
• Width
• Setback
• Proportion of Openings
• Roof Form
• Materials
• Color
• Sidewalk Coverings
• Horizontal Rhythms
• Signs

Case Study: Presidio Design Guidelines

Building Site
  - Unit Masonry
  - Concrete
  - Stucco
  - Wood
  - Architectural Metals
  - Roofs
  - Windows
  - Entrances & Porches
  - New Additions
  - Structural Systems

Interior Spaces
  - Mechanical/Electrical
  - Energy Efficiency
  - Accessibility
  - Health & Safety

Historic District Planning

Alterations
• Use guidelines uniformly
• Review proposed alterations
  – Administrative Review
  – Full Landmarks Commission Review
• Issue Certificate of Appropriateness (COA)
• Inspection/Enforcement

Demolition

Significant/Contributing/Non-Contributing
• Noticing Requirements
• Criteria
  - Physical integrity
  - Context
  - Adverse effect
  - Economic Hardship
• Base zoning incompatibility
• Reuse plan compatibility
• Benign neglect
• Recordation Requirements